

[研究ノート]

インド古典哲学文献の写本資料について（続）

— 『タントラ・ヴァールティカ』写本の現状—

大 前 太

目次

はじめに

1. TVの刊本
2. TVの写本
3. TVにおける北インド系写本と南インド系写本の相違
4. インド写本図書館のカタログおよび利用案内

おわりに

はじめに

前稿においてインド古典哲学の一学派であるミーマーンサー学派に属するクマーリラ (Kumārila) 作『シュローカ・ヴァールティカ (Ślokaṅkārttika)』(以下ŚV) の写本の現状について報告した¹⁾。本稿では同じくクマーリラの著作である『タントラ・ヴァールティカ (Tantravārttika)』(以下TV) の写本の現状について報告したい。

まず、ŚVとTVの関係について確認しておく。ŚVとTVはいずれもシャバラスヴァーミン (Śabaravāmin) 作『シャーバラ・バーシュヤ (Śābarabhāṣya)』(以下ŚBh) に対する注釈である。ŚBhそのものはミーマーンサー学派の根本典籍である『ミーマーンサー・スートラ (Mīmāṃsāsūtra)』(以下MS) に対する注釈である。MSは12の巻 (Adhyāya) から成り、それぞれの巻は4ないし8の章 (Pāda) から成る。ŚBhはMS全編に亘る注釈であるが、クマーリラはŚBhに対して、ŚV、TVおよび『トゥップ・ティーカー (Ṭṭīkā)』(以下ṬṬ) という3種の注釈を著している。ŚVは第1巻第1章(別名「思弁編」(Tarkapāda))に対する注釈であり、TVは第1巻第2章から第3巻まで、ṬṬは第4巻から第12巻までの注釈である。

1. TVの刊本

TVには以下の4種の刊本が存在する。

- (1) The Tantravārtika, A Gloss on Śabaravāmin's Commentary on the Mīmāṃsā Sūtras, by Bhatta Kumārila, edited by Mahāmahopādhyāya Pandit Gangādhara Śāstrī, Benares Sanskrit Series, Nos. 5, 7, 16, 23, 27, 29, 32, 34, 36, 39, 60, 62, & 72, Benares 1903. (以下BSS版)

TV最初の出版である。ŚBhは付されておらず、TV単独の出版である。脚注に異読が挙

げられており、利用した写本に関してka, kha, ga, gha, ñaという略号が使用されている。このことから5種の写本が使用されていることまでは分かるのだが、個々の写本の情報は与えられていない。後の刊本はBSS版をベースとしていると考えられる。長らく入手困難であったが、現在では画像ファイルが容易に入手可能となっている。

- (2) *Mīmāṃsādarśana, Ānandāśrama Sanskrit Series, No.97, Pune 1929-34, 1973-1984*²⁾. (以下ASS版)

MSおよびŚBh全編をカバーした出版であり、TVおよびTṬが付されている。ただし、ŚBhのTarpakpādaについては、ŚVではなく、現代の学者の注釈が付されている。TVに関する限り異読は示されていない。出版元であるプネー市のĀnandāśramaにはTV写本が所蔵されており、同じプネー市にあるバンダルカル東洋学研究所にもTV写本が存在するのだが、それらが使用された形跡はない。ASS版の第2版は入手が容易であることもあって、TV研究に最もよく利用されている。BSS版と同様、ASS版の初版も現在では画像ファイルを容易に入手することができる。

- (3) *The Mīmāṃsā Darśana of Maḥarṣi Jaimini with Śābarabhāṣya of Śābaramuni, Tantravārtika by Kumārila-Bhaṭṭa with its Commnetary of Nyāyasudhā of Someśvara-Bhaṭṭa, Bhāṣyavivaraṇa of Govindāmṛtamuni and Bhāvaprakāśikā by Dr. Mahāprabhūlālā Gosvāmī, edited by Dr. Mahāprabhūlālā Gosvāmī, 4vols., Prachyabharati Series Nos.16, 22, 23, 32, Varanasi 1984-1987.*

ŚBh、TV、TVに対するソーメーシュヴァラ (Someśvara) 作の注釈『ニヤーヤ・スダー (Nyāyasudhā)』、ŚBhに対する現代の学者によるサンスクリットの注釈および校訂者によるヒンディー語の解説から成る刊本である。ASS版と同様、異読が示されていない。

- (4) *Ajitā by Paritosh Mishra, A Commentary on the Tantravārttika of Kumārila, edited by Dr. Kishore Nath Jha, 2 Parts, Ganganatha Jha Kendriya Sanskrit Vidyapitha Text Series Nos.23-24, Allahabad 1988-1990.*

TVに対するパリトーシャ・ミシュラ (Paritoṣamiśra) 作の注釈である『アジター (Ajitā)』の出版であるが、上段にTV、下段にAjitāが配置されている。TV本文に関する限り、脚注にBSS版の読みが異読として示されているが、写本による根拠は示されていない。

近年、針貝邦生氏の尽力によって現行の刊本の不備が改善されつつあるが²⁾、南インド系の写本は手つかずのままである。

2. TVの写本

調査の結果、北インドのデーヴァナーガリー (Devanagari) 写本約30種と南インド系の写本約10種を入手することができた。南インド系の写本については、グランタ (Grantha) 文字、テルグー (Telugu) 文字、マラヤーラム (Malayalam) 文字の写本が含まれている。

Adyar Library, Chennai

No.67575: Palm-leaf, Grantha Script, Folios 93. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 4]

No.VB853: Palm-leaf, Grantha Script, Folios 214. [Beginning-Adhyāya 2, Pāda 4]

No.VB1183b: Palm-leaf, Grantha Script, Folios 51. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2-3]

Ānandāśrama, Pune

No.S14-7-61 (=No.1502): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 38. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]

No.S14-7-62: Paper, Devanagari Script

(a) Folios 34. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]

(b) Folios 70. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3 (upto 271,11)³⁾]

(c) Folios 26. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4 (upto 368,13)]

(d) Folios 46. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1 (Śaka 1748)]

(e) Folios 59. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 2 (Śaka 1748)]

(f) Folios 23. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3]

(g) Folios 49. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 1 (Śaka 1748)]

(h) Folios 22. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 2 (Śaka 1749)]

(i) Folios 47. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3 (Śaka 1748)]

(j) Folios 56. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 4 (Śaka 1748)]

(k) Folios 59. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 5-8 (Śaka 1748)]

No.S14-8-74: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 32. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]

No.S14-8-76 (=No.5925): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 2-29. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4 (321,12-End)]

Anup Sanskrit Library, Bikaner

Nos.6158-79. [複写不可のため未入手]

Asiatic Society, Kolkata

No.III.F.115: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 1-39. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2 (Samvat 1790)].

No.IM.5494: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 1-25, 27-35. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2 (upto 157,22)].

No.IA.3: Paper, Bengali Script, 127pp, 128pp. [Adhyāya 1 & 2]

No.III.G.72: Paper, Devanagari Script

(a) Folios 27. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]

(b) Folios 71. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3]

(c) Folios 20. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4]

(d) Folios 35. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]

(e) Folios 51. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 2]

(f) Folios 19. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3]

(g) Folios 9. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 4]

(h) Folios 38. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 1]

(i) Folios 19. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 2]

(j) Folios 33. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3]

- (k) Folios 47. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 4]
No.I.M.5484: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 36 (by counting). [containing Adhyāya 2, Pāda 2]
No.I.G.41: Paper, Bengali Script, 252pp. [Adhyāya 3]
〔以下の写本は未入手〕
No.8829 (Government Collection)
No.1255 (Government Collection)
No.1256 (Government Collection)
- Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Pune
No.93 of 1869-70: Paper, Devanagari Script
(a) Folios 50. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1 (370,2-458,22, Śaka 1418)]
No.94 of 1869-70: Paper, Devanagari Script
(a) Folios 26. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3 (570,2-623,10)]
(c) Folios 36. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]
No.589 of 1884-87: Paper, Devanagari Script
(a) Folios 2-30. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 4 (891,18-932,9)]
(b) Folios 53. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3 (First half, 160,21-252,17)]
(c) Folios 47. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3 (Second half)]
No.590 of 1884-87: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 33. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4]
No.591 of 1884-87: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 1-35, 37, 39-40. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 2]
- Government Oriental Manuscripts Library, Chennai
No.R.1554: Palm-leaf, Telugu Script, Folios 109. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1-2]
No.R.6053: Palm-leaf, Grantha Script, Folios 212. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3-Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]
No.R.6052: Telugu Script [損傷のため写真撮影不可]
- Kamashwar Singh Sanskrit University, Darbhanga
Raj No.10, Ser. No.2525: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 496. [Transcript]
Raj No.124 (1), Ser. No.2526: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 49.
〔複写不可のため未入手〕
- Oriental Institute, Vadodara
No.131: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 23. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2 (upto 144,17)]
No.1991: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 23. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3 (Śaka 1464)]
No.11169: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 11. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2 (upto 122,23)]
No.11566: Paper, Devanagari Script
(a) Folios 27-33. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2 (148,28-End)]
(b) Folios 1-61. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3 (upto 269,21)]
No.11683: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 51. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3 (First half)]
No.14347: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 3-22a. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4 (323,16-End)]
No.14349: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 1-10, 10, 11-20, 21a. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3 (Beginning-773,15, 773,15-802,19, 802,19-End)]

- No.14351: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 2-18, 19. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 1 (700,4-744,14, 744,14-End, Saṃvat 1937)]
- No.14352: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 2-40, 2-52, 2-41. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3-5] (805,10-887,18, 891,19-987,26, 990,19-1072,17)]
- No.14353: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 1-55. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3 (Second half)]
- No.14356: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 1-47a. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]
- No.14357: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 1-2, 4-35. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4]
- No.14358: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 6-68a. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1 (374,21-End)]
- Oriental Research Institute, University of Mysore
- No.P.1999: Palm-leaf, Grantha Script, Folios 83. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2-3]
- No.P.3015/1: Palm-leaf, Telugu Script, Folios 1-154. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3-Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]
- No.P.3272: Palm-leaf, Grantha Script, Folios 3-100. [Adhyāya 1-2]
- No.P.4059: Palm-leaf, Grantha Script, Folios 31-129. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3-4]
- No.C.2718: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 1-22. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4]
- Oriental Research Institute and Manuscripts Library, University of Kerala, Thiruvananthapuram
- No.297: Malayalam Script, Folios 147-300. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3 (589,11) -End of TV] [Ṭ̣を含む]
- No.12398: Malayalam Script, Folios 13-65, 90-263. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 2-Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3]
- No.C.22: Malayalam Script, Folios 55-146. [Beginning-Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3 (588,23)] [ŚVを含む]
- No.L.1387: Malayalam Script. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3-4]
- Osmania Univesity, Hyderabad
- No.B.94/8/4: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 36. [Adhyāya 1 (18th C.)]
- No.B.94/8/6: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 46. [Adhyāya 1 (18th C.)]
- No.B.17/1/b: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 70. [Adhyāya 1 (18th C.)]
- No.B.16/1/b: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 27. [Adhyāya 1 (16th C.)]
- No.102/3: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 68. [Adhyāya 2 (17th C.)]
- No.103/3: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 52. [Adhyāya 3 (17th C.)] [画像データが存在しないということで未入手]
- Rajasthan Oriental Research Institute, Alwar Branch
- No.878: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 42. [1Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]
- No.879: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 54. [1Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]
- Rajasthan Oriental Research Institute, Jodhpur Branch
- No.19620: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 58. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]
- Rashtriya Sanskrit Sansthan, Ganganath Jha Campus, Allahabad
- No.40501: Paper, Devanagari Script
- (a) Folios 10b-118a, 119b-120b. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3 (169,23-End, Saṃvat 1819)]

- (b) Folios 1-27. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4]
- (c) Folios 1-44a. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]
- (d) Folios 1-72a. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 2]
- (e) Folios 1-26a. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3]
- (f) Folios 59-68. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 1 (723,25-End, Saṃvat 1676)]
- (g) Folios 1-21, 23-59a. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3 (Saṃvat 1581)]
- (h) Tantraratna, Folios 1-132.

No.44107: Paper, Devanagari Script

- (a) Folios 1-97. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3-4]
- (b) Folios 1-9, 12-23. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4]
- (c) Folios 1-54a. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 1]
- (d) Folios 1-38. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]
- (e) Folios 1-24a. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]
- (f) Folios 1-50a [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 4]
- (g) Folios 1-6, 8-11, 14-15, 42b, 43b, 51b. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3 (803,2-827,23)]
- (h) Folios 1-56, 60-63, 64-69. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 2 (Saṃvat 1634)]
- (i) Folios 1-6, 8-28. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3]

No.44425: Paper, Devanagari Script

- (a) Śloka-vārttika, Folios 1-29, 33-114a. [Complete]
- (b) Kāśikāṭikā, Folios 2-32. [TSS版 (1,18-50,7)]
- (c) Śābarabhāṣya, Folios 1-2. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 1]
- (d) Folios 3. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3 (upto 586,28)]
- (e) Folios 1-68. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 5-8 (Saṃvat 1581)]

Sarasvati Bhavana Library, Sampurnanand Sanskrit University, Varanasi

No.29339: Paper, Devanagari Script (Saṃvat 1634)

- (a) Folios 26. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]
- (b) Folios 65. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3]
- (c) Folios 37. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]
- (d) Folios 47. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 2]
- (e) Folios 18. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3]
- (f) Folios 33. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 1]
- (g) Folios 9. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 4]
- (h) Folios 17. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 2]
- (i) Folios 33. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3]
- (j) Folios 41. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 4]
- (k) Folios 46. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 5-8]

No.29645: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 43. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]

[他に約70本の写本が存在するが、現状では入手困難。]

Scindia Oriental Research Institute, Vikram University, Ujjain

No.1022: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 40. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]

- No.1023: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 71. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 2]
No.1024: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 22. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3]
No.1025: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 11. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 4]
No.1026: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 38-59. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 7-8]
No.1027: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 37. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 5-6]
No.1028: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 41. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3]
No.1453: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 21. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 2]
No.1454: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 81. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3]
No.1455: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 26. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4]
No.1456: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 31. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]
No.5565: Paper, Devanagari Script
 (a) Folios 42. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3]
 (b) Folios 53. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 4]
No.5568: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 41. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3]
No.5569: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 38. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]
No.5570: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 24. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4]

Thanjavur Maharaja Serforji's Sarasvati Mahal Library

- No.6774 (B.L.2085c): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 71. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]
〔以下の写本は未入手〕
No.6770 (B.L.2090): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 276. [Adhyāya 1-2]
No.6771 (B.L.9571): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 161. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3]
No.6772 (B.L.2085a): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 149. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3]
No.6773 (B.L.2085b): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 36. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4]
No.6775 (B.L.2085d): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 127. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]
No.6776 (B.L.2085e): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 15. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 4]
No.6777 (B.L.2085f): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 72. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 1]
No.6778 (B.L.2085g): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 36. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 2]
No.6779 (B.L.2085h): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 70. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3]
No.6780 (B.L.2085j): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 94. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 4]
No.6781 (B.L.2085k): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 81. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 5-8]
No.6782 (B.L.9575): Palm-leaf, Nandinagari Script, Folios 132. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 4-8]
No.6783 (B.L.2086): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 59. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 4-8]
No.6784 (B.L.2087): Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 34. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 4]

Vrindavan Research Institute, Vrindavan

- Ser.No.11227 Acc.No.14647: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 57. [Saṃvat 1657]
〔複写不可のため未入手〕
〔以下、未調査〕

Shri Ranbir Sanskrit Research Institute, Janmu

- No.4277: Folios 24. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4]
No.4276: Folios 43.

No.4314: Folios 27. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 2]

No.4317: Folios 17. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3]

Prajñā Pāṭhaśālā Maṇḍala, Wai

Ser.No.6188 L.No.6-4/401: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 636.

Ser.No.6189 L.No.6-4/401: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 33. [Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2]

Ser.No.6190 L.No.6-4/401: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 59. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 2]

Ser.No.6191 L.No.6-4/401: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 82. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 1]

Ser.No.6192 L.No.6-4/401: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 38. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3]

Ser.No.6193 L.No.6-4/401: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 33. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 3]

Ser.No.6194 L.No.6-4/401: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 17. [Adhyāya 2, Pāda 4]

Ser.No.6195 L.No.6-4/401: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 68. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 1]

Ser.No.6196 L.No.6-4/401: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 32. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 2]

Ser.No.6197 L.No.6-4/401: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 68. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 3]

Ser.No.6198 L.No.6-4/401: Paper, Devanagari Script, Folios 79. [Adhyāya 3, Pāda 4]

3. TVにおける北インド系写本と南インド系写本の相違

ŚVと同様に、TV写本についても北インドと南インドとで伝承の違いが見られるのかという点が写本調査の最大の関心事であった。TV全体について検討することは不可能なので、取りあえず目下の関心の対象である「アークリティ論題 (Ākr̥ti Adhikaraṇa)」(1st Adhyāya, 3rd Pāda) について写本の解読を行った。解読が終了した写本は以下の通りである。

Devanagari写本

- A. Asiatic Society, No.III.G.72.
- B. Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, No.589 of 1884-87.
- C. Bodleian Library, Oxford University, Wilson No.325.
- D. Oriental Institute, Vadodara, No.14353.
- E. Rashtriya Sanskrit Sansthan, Ganganatha Jha Campus, No.40501.
- F. Rashtriya Sanskrit Sansthan, Ganganatha Jha Campus, No.44107.
- G. Saraswati Bhavana Library, No.29339.
- H. Scindia Oriental Research Institute, No.1454.
- I. Scindia Oriental Research Institute, No.5568.

Grantha写本

- J. University of Mysore, No.P.4059.

Telugu写本

- K. University of Mysore, No.P.3015/1.

Malayalam写本

- L. University of Kerala, Thiruvananthapuram, No.C.22.

以下は「アークリティ論題」の冒頭部分における刊本（ASS版初版 293,6-30）と写本の読

みの比較であり、刊本の読みと異なる写本の読みを注に示す。

dvau ca pakṣāvupanyastau bhāṣyakāreṇa yadyapi /
 vyākhyātārastathāpyatra kuryuh⁽¹⁾ pakṣāntarānyapi //
 niyogena vikalpena dve vā saha samuccite /
 sambandhaḥ samudāyo vā viśiṣṭā vaikayetarā //
 ete⁽²⁾ pakṣāḥ punaryojyā vyatikirṇāḥ parasparam /
 līṅgākārasaṅkhyābhiḥ saṃhatāsaṃhatātṃmabhiḥ⁽³⁾ //

punar jātyādipakṣāṇāṃ⁽⁴⁾ tādṛśy evātra yojanā⁽⁴⁾ / prathamam tāvad
⁽⁵⁾→aṣṭapakṣy evaṃ⁽⁵⁾ darśayitavyā⁽⁶⁾ / gośabdasyārthaḥ⁽⁷⁾ kim ākṛtir eva,⁽⁸⁾ vyaktir
 eva⁽⁹⁾, ⁽¹⁰⁾→utākṛtir vā⁽¹¹⁾ vyaktir vā, athākṛtiś⁽¹²⁾ ca vyaktiś ca⁽¹⁰⁾, kim ubhayoḥ
 sambandha uta samudāyaḥ, kim ākṛtiviśiṣṭā vyaktir uta⁽¹³⁾ vyaktiviśiṣṭākṛtir iti / tathā
 kim ākṛtyaiva viśiṣṭaḥ sambandhaḥ kiṃ⁽¹⁴⁾ vyaktyaiva⁽¹⁵⁾ ākṛtyā vā⁽¹⁶⁾ vyaktyā vā⁽¹⁷⁾,
 atha samudāyenāpy⁽¹⁸⁾ ākṛtiviśiṣṭayā⁽¹⁹⁾ vyaktyā, atha⁽²⁰⁾ vyaktiviśiṣṭayākṛtyā⁽²¹⁾,
 atha parasparaviśiṣṭābhyāṃ⁽²²⁾ dvābhyāṃ iti / tathā kim⁽²³⁾ ākṛtyaiva viśiṣṭaḥ⁽²⁴⁾
 samudāya ityādy api pūrvavad eva sambandhaviśiṣṭasamudāyapakṣamātrātiriktam⁽²⁵⁾
 yojaniyam / evaṃ⁽²⁶⁾→kim⁽²⁷⁾ ākṛtyaiva viśiṣṭaḥ sambandha eva, uta vyaktyaiva, atha
 vākṛtyā vā⁽²⁸⁾ vyaktyā vā⁽²⁹⁾, atha⁽³⁰⁾ samudāyena kim anyataraviśiṣṭayānyatarayā⁽³¹⁾,
 athobhābhyāṃ⁽²⁶⁾ ity evaṃ samudāyaviśeṣaṇatvapakṣāḥ⁽³²⁾ / pūrvavad eva⁽³³⁾ yojyāḥ /
 evaṃ kiṃ sambandhenaiva viśiṣṭākṛtir atha samudāyenaivātha vikalpamānābhyāṃ⁽³⁴⁾
 uta samuccitābhyāṃ / tathaitadviśiṣṭā⁽³⁵⁾ kim ākṛtir evātha vyaktir eva, atha⁽³⁶⁾
 vikalpita kiṃ samuccite kim⁽³⁷⁾ iti / tathā kim ākṛtiviśiṣṭasambandhaviśiṣṭā vyaktir
 evātha vyaktiviśiṣṭasambandhaviśiṣṭākṛtir evātha⁽³⁸⁾ vikalpa uta⁽³⁹⁾ samuccayaḥ /
 evaṃ samudāyenāpi⁽⁴⁰⁾ yojyam/tathā⁽⁴¹⁾→sambandhaviśiṣṭavyaktiviśiṣṭākṛtir evātha
 sambandhaviśiṣṭākṛtiviśiṣṭā vyaktir⁽⁴¹⁾ evātha⁽⁴²⁾ vikalpo'tha samuccayaḥ / evaṃ
 samudāyaviśiṣṭapakṣāḥ kalpayitavyāḥ / tathā kiṃ jātyaiva viśiṣṭena sambandhena
 viśiṣṭā vyaktiḥ, atha vyaktyaiva⁽⁴³⁾ viśiṣṭena sambandhena viśiṣṭā jātir atha vikalpo'
 tha samuccayaḥ / evaṃ samudāyenāpi viśiṣṭatā yojyā / tathā kiṃ sambandhenaiva
 viśiṣṭayā jātyaiva viśiṣṭā vyaktir utaivaṃvidhayā vyaktyaiva viśiṣṭā jātir atha vikalpo'tha
 samuccayaḥ⁽⁴⁴⁾ /

(1) B. J. L. brūyuh (2) J. ye te (3) K. saṃhitāsaṃhitātṃmabhiḥ (4) K. tādṛśyo
 vātra yojanāḥ (5) J. K. evaṃ aṣṭapakṣi, L. eva for evaṃ (6) J. K. L. pradarśitavyā
 (7) K. om. arthaḥ (8) A. B. C. ins. atha vā, J. ins. uta before vyaktir (9) L. ins. vā
 after eva (10) J. uta vyaktir vā ākṛtir vā atha vā vyaktiś cākṛtiś ca, K. vyaktiṣṭhā (?)
 ākṛtiṣṭhā (?) atha vā vyaktiś cākṛtiś ca (11) L. om. vā (12) D. om. atha, E. H. uta
 L. kim for atha (13) B. C. atha for uta (14) J. uta (15) A. ins. athāpi, B. C. D. E. H.
 L. ins. atha, J. K. ins. atha vā before ākṛtyā (16) J. K. om. vā (17) L. ins. athākṛtyā
 vyaktyā ca after vā (18) B. G. L. atha for api, C. samuccayenārtha, J. K. om. api (19)
 B. -viśiṣṭā for -viśiṣṭayā (20) K. om. atha (21) J. K. ins. vā after -ākṛtyā (22) J. K. ins.
 atha after -viśiṣṭābhyāṃ (23) J. om. kim (24) A. viśiṣṭa- for viśiṣṭaḥ (25) J. -viśiṣṭaḥ

for -viśiṣṭa-, K. sambandhāviśiṣṭasamydāyamātrātiriktam (26) L. kim sambandhena viśiṣṭākṛtir eva vyaktir eva vā athākṛtir vvyaktir vā atha samudāḥ atha samudāyaḥ kim anyatara viśiṣṭānyatarā athobhe (27) J. om. kim (28) A. om. vā (29) K. om. vyaktyā vā (30) K. uta (31) J. K. anyayā for anyatarayā (32) B. -viśeṣaṇa- for -viśeṣaṇatva- (33) J. K. om. eva (34) J. K. vikalpitābhyām, L. vikalpyamānābhyām (35) A. B. C. H. I. J. K. tathaitadviśiṣṭāpi, G. tathaivaitadviśiṣṭāpi, L. tathaiva tadviśiṣṭāpi (36) B. kim for atha (37) A. B. C. J. K. om. kim (38) B. om. eva (39) B. J. K. atha for uta (40) C. J. K. L. samudāye'pi (41) C. J. K. L. sambandhaviśiṣṭākṛtīviśiṣṭā vyaktir eva atha sambandhaviśiṣṭāvvyaktīviśiṣṭākṛtir eva (42) C. om. eva (43) B. śabdavyaktyaiva (44) E. F. samudāyaḥ

刊本であるBSS版とASS版とはまったく同じ読みを示しているが、写本レベルではかなりの読みの違いが見られる。また、南インド系写本はいずれも刊本やDevanagari写本とはかなり異なる読みを含むことも確認できた。

4. インド写本図書館のカタログおよび利用案内

写本資料の収集には写本カタログを参照することが不可欠である。以下、調査の際に利用した写本図書館のカタログと図書館の簡単な利用案内を示す。ただし、インドの写本図書館ではしばしば規定が変更されるため、以下の利用案内はあくまでも目安である。

New Catalogus Catalogorum

New Catalogus Catalogorum, An Alphabetical Register of Sanskrit and Allied Works and Authors, Volume VIII, University of Madras, Madras 1974.

New Catalogus Catalogorum, An Alphabetical Register of Sanskrit and Allied Works and Authors, Volume XX, University of Madras, Chennai 2011.

Notices of Sanskrit Manuscripts, Vol.VII, Reprint, Delhi 1990.

Adyar Library and Research Centre, Chennai

Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Adyar Library, Vol.IX - Mīmāṃsā and Advaita Vedānta, The Adyar Library and Research Centre, Madras 1952.

Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts, Volume XIII, Viśvabhāratī Collection [I], The Adyar Library and Research Centre, Madras 1976.

[写真撮影可。費用は1クリックにつき10ルピー。月曜閉館、開館時間 9:00-16:00。]

Ānandāśrama, Pune

[過去カタログは無効となっており、研究所備え付きのリストによって写本の所蔵を確認。写真撮影可能。費用は1フォルオにつき120ルピー。]

Anup Sanskrit Library, Bikaner

A Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Anup Sanskrit Library, Fort Bikaner, compiled by C. Kunhan Raja and K. Madhva Krishna Sarma.

[閲覧可・複写不可。閲覧室使用料1日500ルピー。]

Asiatic Society, Kolkata

Catalogue of Printed Books and Manuscripts in Sanskrit belonging to the Oriental Library of the Asiatic Society of Bengal, Calcutta 1904.

A Descriptive Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Collections of the Asiatic Society (Government Collection), Vol.XI: Philosophy, The Asiatic Society, Calcutta 1957.

A Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Library of Asiatic Society (The Indian Museum and the Asiatic Society Collections), Volume IV: Philosophy, Part II: Pūrva-Mīmāṃsā, The Asiatic Society, Calcutta 1969.

Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts—Indian Philosophy (Indian Museum Collection), the Asiatic Society, Kolkata 2001.

〔複写は全体の3分の1まで。パスポート、ビザのコピー提出。〕

Banaras Hindu University

Descriptive Catalogue of Samskrit Manuscripts in Gaekwada Library, Bhārat Kalā Bhavana and Samskrit Mahāvidyālaya Library, Banaras Hindu University, Varanasi 1971.

Bangiya Sahitya Parishad, Kolkata

A Descriptive Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Vaṅgiya Sahitya Parishad, Calcutta 1935.

〔写真撮影可能。ただし3ショットのみ。費用は1ショットにつき、20ルピー。〕

Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Pune

〔研究所備え付きのカードボックスにより写本の所蔵を確認。写真撮影可能。費用は1フォルリオにつき100ルピー〕

DAV College, Chandigarh

A Catalogue of Manuscripts in the Vishvesvarananda Vedic Research Institute, 2 Parts, Hoshiarpur 1959.

〔かつてHoshiarpurのVishvesvarananda Vedic Research Instituteに所蔵されていた写本がDAV Collegeに移管されている。写真撮影可能。費用は1フォルリオにつき10ルピー。〕

Government Oriental Manuscripts Library, University of Madras, Chennai

A Triennial Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts collected for the Government Oriental Manuscripts Library, Madras.

A Descriptive Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Government Oriental Manuscripts Library, Madras.

An Alphabetical Index of Manuscripts in the Government Oriental Manuscripts Library, Madras, 2 Parts, Madras 1938-40.

〔写真撮影可能、無料。金-土閉館、開館時間 10:00-17:45、平日はエアコン付き。〕

Kamashwar Singh Sanskrit University, Darbhanga

A Descriptive Catalogue of Raj Manuscripts preserved in Kamashwar Singh Sanskrit

- University compiled by B.R.Sharma, Darbhanga 1966.
〔複写不可。担当者はメモを取ることも不可ということであったが、Vice Chancellorとの交渉により閲覧および書写は可能。〕
- Maharaja Serfojis Sarasvati Mahal Library, Thanjavur
A Descriptive Catalogue of the Sanskrit manuscripts in the Tanjore Mahārāja Serfoji's Sarasvati Mahāl Library, Tanjore by P.P.Sastri, Vol.XII, Tanjore 1931.
〔申請書提出するも連絡なし。インドに居所がないと困難か。〕
- Mumbai University, Mumbai
A Descriptive Catalogue of Itchchārām Suryarām Desāi Collection in the Library of Bombay University, compiled by H.D. Velankar, Bombay University, 1953.
〔写真撮影可能。ただし全体の3分の1まで。費用は10ショットまで25ルピー、以下1ショットにつき3ルピー。〕
- National Museum, New Delhi
Descriptive Catalogue of Manuscripts from Indian Collections, National Museum, New Delhi, 1964.
- Oriental Institute, Vadodara
An Alphabetical List of Manuscripts in the Oriental Institute, 4 vols. Vadodara 1942-2008.
〔デジタルデータ取得可能。費用は1フォルリオにつき80ルピー。〕
- Oriental Research Institute, University of Mysore, Mysore
Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts, Volume X, Oriental Research Institute, University of Mysore, Mysore 1984.
〔写真撮影可。費用は1フォルリオにつき10ルピー。〕
- Oriental Research Institute and Manuscripts Library, University of Kerala, Thiruvananthapuram
A Descriptive Catalogue of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in H. H. Maharajah's Palace Library, Trivandrum, Vol.III: Vedānta, Mīmāṃsā, Vyākaraṇa, Nyāya and Jyotisa, Trivandrum 1938.
A Descriptive Catalogue the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Curator's Office Library, Trivandrum, Vol.III: Vedānta, Mīmāṃsā and Vyākaraṇa, edited by K.Mahādeva Śāstrī, Trivandrum 1939.
Alphabetical Index of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the University Manuscripts Library, Trivandrum, Vol.I (A to ण), Trivandrum Sanskrit Series No.186, University of Kerala, Trivandrum 1957.
Alphabetical Index of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the University Manuscripts Library, Trivandrum, Vol.II (Ta to Ma), Trivandrum Sanskrit Series No.215, University of Kerala, Trivandrum 1965.
Alphabetical Index of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Oriental Research Institute and Manuscripts Library, Trivandrum, Vol.III (YA to SA), Trivandrum Sanskrit Series No.254, University of Kerala, Trivandrum 1984.

Alphabetical Index of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Oriental Research Institute and Manuscripts Library, Trivandrum, Vol.IV (Sa-Ha), Trivandrum Sanskrit Series No.256, University of Kerala, Trivandrum 1986.

Alphabetical Index of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Oriental Research Institute and Manuscripts Library, Trivandrum, (Supplementary), Vol.V (A to Ta), Trivandrum Sanskrit Series No.259, University of Kerala, Trivandrum 1988.

Alphabetical Index of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Oriental Research Institute and Manuscripts Library, Trivandrum, (Supplementary), Vol.VI (Da to Ra), Trivandrum Sanskrit Series No.264, University of Kerala, Thiruvananthapuram 1995.

Alphabetical Index of the Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Oriental Research Institute and Manuscripts Library, Trivandrum, (Supplementary), Vol.VII (Ra to Ha), Trivandrum Sanskrit Series No.266, University of Kerala, Trivandrum 2000.

〔図書館のP.L. Shaji氏に写真撮影依頼することになっている。〕

Osmania University, Hyderabad

A Catalogue of The Sanskrit Manuscripts in The Osmania University Library, The Sanskrit Academy, Hyderabad 1964.

〔撮影済みのデータのみ取得可能。費用は1フォルオにつき10ルピー。〕

Prajñā Pāṭhaśālā Maṇḍala, Wai

Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in Prajñā Pāṭhaśālā Maṇḍala, 2 Parts, Wai 1970.

Rajasthan Oriental Research Institute, Alwar Branch, Alwar

A Catalogue of Sanskrit and Prakrit manuscripts in the Rajasthan Oriental Research Institute, Part XXI (Alwar Collection), Jodhpur 1985.

〔写真撮影可。費用は1フォルオにつき10ルピー。〕

Rajasthan Oriental Research Institute, Jodhpur Branch, Jodhpur

A Catalogue of Sanskrit and Prakrit manuscripts in the Rajasthan Oriental Research Institute.

〔デジタルデータ取得可能。費用は1フォルオにつき10ルピー。パスポート、ビザのコピー提出。〕

Rashtriya Sanskrit Samsthan, Ganganatha Jha Campus, Allahabad

Descriptive Catalogue of Manuscripts, Volume-XI Darśana-śāstra, Part-II Mīmāṃsā Vedānta, Rastriya Sanskrit Sansthan (Deemed University), Ganganatha Campus, Allahabad 2012.

〔デジタルデータ取得可能。費用は1フォルオにつき5ルピー。Rashtriya Sanskrit Sansthan本部（デリー）のVice Chancellorの許可書を要求されたことがある。〕

Saraswati Bhavana Library, Sampūrnānand Sanskrit University, Varanasi

A Descriptive Catalogue of The Sanskrit Manuscripts acquired for and deposited in the Sanskrit University Library (Sarasvati Bhavana), Varanasi, during the years 1791-1950, Volume VII, Varanasi 1961.

A Descriptive Catalogue of The Sanskrit Manuscripts Acquired for and Deposited in

the Sampurnanand Sanskrit University (Sarasvati-Bhavana) Library Varanasi during the years 1791-1950, Volume XIII, Varanasi 1987.

A Descriptive Catalogue of The Sanskrit Manuscripts Acquired for and Deposited in the Sampurnanand Sanskrit University (Sarasvati-Bhavana) Library, Varanasi during the years 1951-1981, Volume VII, Part II, Varanasi 1992.

〔1回の申請につき複写は100フォリオまで〕

Scindia Oriental Research Institute, Vikram University, Ujjain

〔研究所備え付きのリストにより写本の所蔵を確認。写真撮影可能。費用は1フォリオにつき40ルピー。パスポートのコピー提出。〕

Shri Ranbir Sanskrit Research Institute, Jammu

Descriptive Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in Shri Ranbir Sanskrit Research Institute, Jammu, Volume II, 1984.

Vrindavan Research Institute

A Catalogue of Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Vrindavan Research Institute, Vrindavan, Part IV, 1985.

〔閲覧可・複写不可〕

おわりに

以上、ŚVおよびTV関係写本についてこれまで筆者が知りえた情報を紹介した。ŚVおよびTVいずれに関しても現行の刊本には不備が見られるため、写本資料を利用した改訂が急務である。その際には、北インドと南インドの写本の相違を考慮に入れて校訂を行う必要があるであろう。

〔付記〕

前稿脱稿後、Kāśikāṭikāの新たな出版が存在することが判明した。Mimāṃsā-sloka-vārttikam, Sucaritamīśrapraṇīṭayā Kāśikākhyaṭā Ṭikayā Sametam, Rashtriya Sanskrit Sansthan, New Delhi, 2014. ただし、この版はTSS版 (Part I & II) を組み換えたものに過ぎない。また、ケーララ大学東洋学研究所兼写本図書館所蔵のKāśikāṭikāのTranscript (No.T327) について、前稿において「Vanavāda以降は同じくORIMLK所蔵のC.1333写本からの転写と考えられる」(p.54) と述べたが、精査の結果、Vanavāda、VākyādhikaraṇaおよびVedādhikaraṇaはC.1779A写本からの転写、SambandhaparihāravādaからŚabdādhikaraṇaまでがC.1333写本からの転写であることが判明した。前稿の記述を訂正する。これはC.1779A写本が先に転写され、後にC.1333写本から空白部分が転写されたためと考えられる。

注

- 1) 拙稿「インド古典哲学文献の写本資料について——『シュローカ・ヴァールティカ』関係写本の現状——」『総合政策論叢』第35号、島根県立大学総合政策学会、2018年、pp.45-57.
- 2) Kunio Harikai, (1) Sanskrit Text of the *Tantravārttika*, Adhyāya 1, Pāda 4, Collated with four Manuscripts, *Annual Report of Medical Anthropology and Humanity*, Saga Medical School, 2006,

pp.1-58. (2) Sanskrit Text of the *Tantravārttika*, Adhyāya 1, Pāda 2, Collated with four Manuscripts, *Annual Report of Medical Anthropology and Humanity*, Saga Medical School, 2007, pp.1-69. (3) Sanskrit Text of the *Tantravārttika*, Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3, Adhikaraṇa 1-3, Collated with five Manuscripts, *Annual Report of Medical Anthropology and Humanity*, Saga Medical School, 2008, pp.1-47. (4) Sanskrit Text of the *Tantravārttika*, Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3, Adhikaraṇa 4-6, Collated with six Manuscripts, *South Asian Classical Studies*, No.4, 2009, pp.259-396. 5) Sanskrit Text of the *Tantravārttika*, Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3, Adhikaraṇa 7-8, Collated with six Manuscripts, *South Asian Classical Studies*, No.5, 2010, pp.223-249. 6) Sanskrit Text of the *Tantravārttika*, Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3, Adhikaraṇa 9, Collated with five Manuscripts, *South Asian Classical Studies*, No.6, 2011, pp.259-396. 7) Sanskrit Text of the *Tantravārttika*, Adhyāya 1, Pāda 3, Adhikaraṇa 10, 11, Lokavedaikya Adhikaraṇa and Ākrtyadhikaraṇa, Collated with four Manuscripts, *South Asian Classical Studies*, No.7, 2012, pp.57-90.

3) ページ数、行数はASS版初版による。

キーワード：ミーマーンサー学派、クマーリラ、タントラヴァールティカ、写本

(OMAE Futoshi)